



**TECHNIUM**  
SOCIAL SCIENCES JOURNAL

[www.techniumscience.com](http://www.techniumscience.com)



**Vol. 68/2025**  
**A New Decade for Social Changes**

**PLUS**  
**COMMUNICATION P**



**International**  
Communication & PR

## **Performance Management of State Civil Apparatus in the Staffing and Human Resource Development Agency of East Bolaang Mongondow Regency**

**Siedmy Chyryl Lengkong<sup>1</sup>, Wilson Bogar<sup>2</sup>, Thelma Wawointana<sup>3</sup>, Marthinus Mandagi<sup>4</sup>**

Public Administration Magister Program, Universitas Negeri Manado, Indonesia

Email: [siedmyl@gmail.com](mailto:siedmyl@gmail.com)<sup>1</sup>, [wilsonbogar@unima.ac.id](mailto:wilsonbogar@unima.ac.id)<sup>2</sup>,  
[thelmawawointana@unima.ac.id](mailto:thelmawawointana@unima.ac.id)<sup>3</sup>, [marthinusmandagi@unima.ac.id](mailto:marthinusmandagi@unima.ac.id)<sup>4</sup>

**Abstract.** This study aims to determine and analyze the State Civil Apparatus (ASN) Performance Management of the Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency in East Bolaang Mongondow Regency which includes the stages of performance planning, stages of implementation, monitoring, and performance coaching, stages of performance evaluation, and stages of follow-up on performance evaluation results. This research used descriptive qualitative methods. The research instruments used were interview guides, documents/literature, and photos/documentation. Data collection techniques were carried out through interviews, observation, and documentation. Based on the results of the research, the State Civil Apparatus (ASN) Performance Management at the Staffing and Human Resources Development Agency of East Bolaang Mongondow Regency has not been carried out optimally due to the lack of understanding of appraisal officials and assessed employees regarding the State Civil Apparatus (ASN) Performance Management. The recommendation of this research is for the Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency of East Bolaang Mongondow Regency to carry out socialization and training on performance management of the State Civil Apparatus, so that every State Civil Apparatus in the Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency of East Bolaang Mongondow Regency knows how to implement performance management in accordance with the Regulation of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform Number 6 of 2022 concerning Performance Management of State Civil Apparatus Employees.

**Keywords.** Management, Performance, State Civil Apparatus, Human Resources

### **A. Introduction**

Performance Management based on the Regulation of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform of the Republic of Indonesia Number 6 of 2022 concerning Performance Management of State Civil Apparatus Employees is an instrument used to achieve government goals and objectives. Performance Management shows the roles, results and responsibilities of each State Civil Apparatus (ASN) employee in the regional apparatus to be aligned with the performance goals and objectives of the regional apparatus where the State Civil Apparatus employee is assigned [1]. The implementation of Performance Management is

aimed at State Civil Apparatus Employees consisting of Civil Servants and Government Employees with Work Agreements (PPPK) which based on Article 11 of Law Number 20 of 2023 concerning the State Civil Apparatus reads “State Civil Apparatus Employees are tasked with: a) implementing public policies made by the Staff Supervisory Official in accordance with the provisions of laws and regulations; b) providing professional and quality public services; and c) strengthening the unity and integrity of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia.” [2].

State Civil Apparatus in carrying out their duties are required to be assessed by their superiors to identify employees who carry out their duties professionally, employees who carry out their duties but are not optimal and employees who do not carry out their duties. Performance appraisals and the results of performance appraisals / performance evaluation results are reported in stages by performance appraisal officials to authorized officials, in this case the head of the work unit in charge of staffing, for performance ranking as a basis for awarding or sanctioning (Kristiana, 2015) [3].

The Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency (BKPSDM) as one of the regional devices based on Article 1 of the Regulation of the Regent of East Bolaang Mongondow Number 8 of 2023 concerning the Position, Structure, Organization, Duties and Functions and Work Procedures of Regional Devices which reads “The Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency, hereinafter referred to as BKPSDM, is a regional device that carries out the functions of personnel administration and development of district / city regional resources in accordance with the provisions of laws and regulations and regional authority.” [4].

The head of the staffing and human resource development agency of East Bolaang Mongondow Regency as the head of the unit in charge of staffing through the field of apparatus competency development, apparatus performance appraisal, and awards carries out the task of managing the results of the performance evaluation document.

State Civil Apparatus employees within the scope of the government of East Bolaang Mongondow Regency. Performance evaluation documents of State Civil Apparatus employees within the scope of the government of East Bolaang Mongondow Regency Results. Good Performance Management of State Civil Apparatus will provide Real Time Information on the state of performance of State Civil Apparatus which can be utilized for the achievement of the Objectives, Duties and Functions of each Regional Apparatus because it can be used as a basis for improving performance and awarding State Civil Apparatus Because the implementation of performance management can provide motivation to employees in competence, expertise, and skills. The information can also be used for the Implementation of State Civil Apparatus Management Activities which include 1) Identification and planning of education and / or training needs; 2) Developing competence; 3) Providing benefits; 4) Consideration of mutations and promotions; 5) Providing awards and imposing sanctions in accordance with the provisions of laws and regulations; 6) Following up on issues set out in the performance evaluation document; and 7) Conducting an State Civil Apparatus Professionalism Index measurement.

Based on the results of the author's observations as a State Civil Apparatus in charge of managing performance evaluation documents at the staffing and human resource development agency, it was found that there were often delays in collecting Employee Performance Objectives (SKP) which should be entered no later than the end of February of the following year at the Staffing and Human Resources Development Agency of East Bolaang Mongondow Regency, The number of SKP documents entered with the number of State Civil Apparatus in the Regional Apparatus Organization (OPD) does not match because it is

incomplete, There are still many State Civil Apparatus who compile SKPs that do not conduct Performance dialogues with leaders for the preparation of the Role and Result Sharing Matrix so that the leader's Work Result Plan that is intervened in the subordinate's SKP is different from the Work Result Plan in the Leader's SKP, It is still found that the SKP is entered in an incomplete format, namely the evaluation document that is entered without attaching the SKP or without attaching the results of the employee performance evaluation, the average SKP Evaluation Results of civil servants' assessments are always of good value, which in reality there are civil servants who are rarely seen in the Work Unit, Work Result Plans that do not describe the actual implementation of tasks for one year, the implementation of performance guidance for civil servants whose performance is not yet guided by applicable regulations, and the realization of performance evaluation follow-up based on applicable regulations.

Based on the BKPSDM State Civil Apparatus Data Recap that has entered SKP which can be seen in table 1 below:

**Table 1.** Data Recap of BKPSDM State Civil Apparatus that has Submitted SKP

Period	Total of State Civil Apparatus	Submitted SKP	Not Submitted SKP
1 Januari – 31 Desember 2021	31	14	17
1 Januari – 31 Desember 2022	33	21	12
1 Januari – 31 Desember 2023	33	8	25

*Source: BKPSDM of East Bolaang Mongondow*

The data shows that there are still many State Civil Apparatus at the Staffing and Human Resources Development Agency (BKPSDM) of East Bolaang Mongondow Regency who do not prepare SKP, this is an indication of problems in the implementation of performance management at BKPSDM East Bolaang Mongondow Regency.

Based on the description above, the author assumes that the performance management of the State Civil Apparatus of the Staffing and HR Development Agency of East Bolaang Mongondow Regency is still not optimal in its implementation. So that the author feels the need to analyze the performance management of State Civil Apparatus at the Personnel and HR Development Agency of East Bolaang Mongondow Regency which is carried out based on the Regulation of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform Number 6 of 2022 concerning Performance Management of State Civil Apparatus Employees.

The main purpose of this study is to determine and analyze the Performance Management of State Civil Apparatus of the Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency in East Bolaang Mongondow Regency which includes the performance planning stage, the implementation, monitoring and coaching stages of performance, the performance evaluation stage, and the follow-up stage of performance evaluation results.

## **B. Method**

The type of research used is descriptive qualitative. Sugiyono in Wawointana et al. (2023) states that "Qualitative research methods are research methods based on the philosophy

of postpositivism or enterpretive, used to research on natural object conditions, where the researcher is the key instrument, data collection techniques are triangulated (combined observation, interviews, documentation), the data obtained tends to be qualitative data, data analysis is inductive / qualitative, and qualitative research results are to understand meaning, understand uniqueness, construct phenomena and find hypotheses.” [5].

In this study, the focus of research is the Performance Management of State Civil Apparatus at the Personnel and HR Development Agency of East Bolaang Mongondow Regency with indicators: a) Performance planning which includes setting and clarifying expectations; b) Implementation, monitoring, and coaching of employee performance which includes documenting performance, providing continuous feedback, and developing employee performance; c) Employee performance appraisal which includes employee performance evaluation; and d) Follow-up on employee performance evaluation results which includes rewards and sanctions.

The number of informants was 7 people who were determined by purposive sampling method. The data collection techniques used were observation, interviews and documentation studies. The data analysis technique used the interactive model of Miles and Huberman (2005) in Mandagi et al. (2023), namely: data collection, data reduction, data display, and conclusion/verification [6].

### **C. Result and discussion**

Performance Management of State Civil Apparatus is carried out for the achievement of organizational goals and objectives so that it is very important to be implemented by all regional apparatus organizations (OPD) if not implemented it will result in less or non-achievement of OPD goals and objectives and will have an impact on the performance of civil servants in OPD (Kairupan & Mandagi, 2019) [7]. Based on the research objectives, namely to determine and analyze the Performance Management of State Civil Apparatus at the Staffing and HR Development Agency in East Bolaang Mongondow Regency which includes the performance planning stage, the implementation, monitoring, and performance coaching stages, the performance evaluation stage, and the follow-up stage of performance evaluation results, the authors collected data and information related to the performance management of State Civil Apparatus at the Staffing and HR Development Agency of East Bolaang Mongondow Regency by conducting interviews and observations of informants related to this research. The research entitled Performance Management of State Civil Apparatus at the Personnel and HR Development Agency of East Bolaang Mongondow Regency uses descriptive qualitative research with 4 indicators which are components of performance management.

#### ***Performance planning***

In Performance Management, the initial stage that must be carried out is Performance Planning which includes setting and clarifying expectations, making this stage important to be carried out in accordance with the guidelines (Rajab et al., 2022) [8]. The following are the results of research on performance planning indicators which include setting and clarifying expectations obtained from observations and interviews in Langapan which have been processed by researchers:

**Table 2.** Research Findings on Performance Planning Indicator

Indicator	Findings
Performance Planning	Performance Planning is carried out at the time of promotion and performance data requests by filling in the Tasks, Principles, and Functions and Employee Performance Agreements into the SKP Format based on the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform Regulation Number 6 of 2022.

*Source: data processed by researchers (2024)*

Based on the results of the study, it was found that Performance Planning is carried out at the time of promotion and performance data requests by filling out the Duties, Principles, and Functions and Employee Performance Agreements into the SKP Format based on the Regulation of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform Number 6 of 2022. So it can be seen that the performance planning of the staffing and human resource development agency of eastern Bolaang Mongondow Regency is carried out only when employees who are considered to have an interest related to their employment status or requests for employment data:

- a) Look at the overall picture of the organization in the agency/work unit strategic plan and work unit performance agreement documents
- b) Establish and Clarify Work Result Expectations and Work Behavior of High-Level Officials and Leaders of Independent Work Units and Put them in the SKP Format
- c) Develop a Performance Indicator Manual for SKP of High-Level Officials and Leaders of Independent Work Units.
- d) Develop a Strategy for Achieving Work Results
- e) Dividing Employee Roles Based on Work Result Achievement Strategies
- f) Determine the Type of Work Result Plan
- g) Establish and Clarify Expectations of Work Results and Work Behavior of Administrative Officials and Functional Officials and Include them in the SKP Format
- h) Agree on Required Resources, Accountability Scheme, and Consequences of Employee Performance Achievement and Include in SKP Attachment Format

If this performance planning stage is carried out, then each performance appraisal official can apply a job analysis (Idawati, 2017) [9]. According to Sinambela and Ana (2016) that “job analysis is a systematic activity to examine a job by determining the duties and responsibilities of a job, the knowledge, abilities and skills required” [10]. So that by applying job analysis, the assessing official can find the right employee in carrying out the assigned tasks. So that by not implementing performance planning in the staffing and human resource development agency of East Bolaang Mongondow Regency can result in the incompatibility of employee competencies with the assigned tasks, this can cause obstacles in carrying out tasks which will affect the achievement of the goals and objectives of the organization.

### ***Implementation, monitoring, and coaching of employee performance***

Implementing, monitoring and coaching employee performance includes documenting performance, providing ongoing feedback and developing employee performance. Employees implement performance plans after performance planning is carried out, which includes setting and clarifying expectations. Performance implementation is documented periodically and then evaluated by providing feedback, the results of which are used in employee performance development (Nubatonis et al., 2015) [11]. The following are the results of research on

indicators of implementation, monitoring and coaching of employee performance obtained from observations and interviews in Langapan which have been processed by researchers:

**Table 3.** Research Findings on Indicator of Implementing, monitoring, and coaching employee performance

Indicator	Findings
Implementing, monitoring, and coaching employee performance	Employees carry out their main tasks and functions routinely. The Performance Appraisal Officer directly monitors each employee who is assessed to then provide feedback assessment based on attitude, behavior and discipline which will later be poured into the SKP format in accordance with the regulation of the minister of state apparatus empowerment and bureaucratic reform Number 6 of 2022.

*Source: data processed by researchers (2024)*

Based on the results of the research, it was found that employees carry out their duties, principal and functions routinely. The Performance Appraisal Officer directly monitors each employee who is assessed to then provide feedback assessment based on attitude, behavior and discipline which will later be poured into the SKP format in accordance with the Regulation of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform Number 6 of 2022. So it can be seen that employees in carrying out their duties do not carry out documentation so that the provision of objective feedback and in accordance with the results of work is not carried out in accordance with the Regulation of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform Number 6 of 2022.

The results of documentation of the work of each employee are important for data collection from direct supervisors as a basis for providing feedback and performance development aimed at improving employee performance. This is supported by the opinion of Bogar (2019) which states that data collection is collecting information about organizational or individual performance with the aim of improving performance, where the methods often used by leaders are periodic observations carried out repeatedly, collecting data and information from each employee in meetings through prepared instruments, reviewing the work carried out by employees, collecting information through in-depth interviews [12].

Feedback given tends to be subjective because it is done by looking at behavioral attitudes towards their respective superiors without seeing the results of performance documentation from each employee. Subjective feedback will hinder the development of employee performance both training and providing performance counseling. Providing training that is not implemented in accordance with the Regulation of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform Number 6 of 2022 at the Human Resources Staffing and Development Agency can result in undeveloped employee skills, abilities, knowledge and attitudes which will affect the achievement of organizational goals. This is supported by the opinion of Sinambela (2021) which states that “training is a systematic process from the organization to develop individual skills, abilities, knowledge, or attitudes that can change employee behavior to achieve predetermined goals” [13].

#### ***Employee Performance Appraisal***

Employee performance evaluation is carried out by direct supervisors or other officials who are given delegation periodically and annually by taking into account the performance quadrant in giving employee performance predicates (Sendouw et al., 2023) [14]. The following

are the results of research on Employee Performance Appraisal indicators obtained from observations and interviews in Langapan which have been processed by researchers:

**Table 4.** Research Findings on Employee Performance Appraisal Indicator

Indicator	Findings
Employee Performance Appraisal	Performance appraisal is carried out based on employee attitude and discipline. The rating of work results is determined based on the results of the implementation of tasks and the rating of work behavior is determined based on the attitude and discipline of employees. The performance predicate will be given good if the work results, attitude and behavior of employees are good then poured into the SKP format according to the regulation of the minister of state apparatus empowerment and bureaucratic reform number 6 of 2022.

*Source: data processed by researchers (2024)*

Based on the results of the study, it was found that performance appraisal is carried out based on employee attitude and discipline. The rating of work results is determined based on the results of the implementation of tasks and the rating of work behavior is determined based on the attitude and discipline of employees. The performance predicate will be given good if the work results, attitude and behavior of employees are good then poured into the SKP format according to permenpan rb number 6 of 2022. The performance appraisal applied at the Personnel and HR Development Agency of East Bolaang Mongondow Regency is not carried out in accordance with the Regulation of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform Number 6 of 2022, the performance appraisal process should be carried out in stages, namely: 1) Determine the annual/periodic performance achievements of the organization; 2) Determine the distribution pattern of annual performance predicates based on annual organizational performance achievements; 3) Determine employee performance predicates by taking into account the contribution of employee performance to the organization.

In determining the predicate of employee performance, attitude and discipline are also taken into consideration, but the basis for determining the performance predicate is the results of feedback provided by the leadership which is then assessed based on the performance quadrant to determine the performance predicate for the employee being assessed (Djadjuli, 2018) [15]. Performance appraisal should be carried out in accordance with the guidelines, it cannot be done only formally, this is supported by Sinambela's opinion (2021) that "performance appraisal is not an easy thing, it needs caution and accuracy. Without paying attention to this, performance appraisals may not meet the quality of measurement. If this happens, of course, the performance produced by employees cannot be accounted for and can receive widespread criticism from stakeholders, especially employees" [13].

#### ***Follow-up on Performance Evaluation Results***

Follow-up on performance evaluation results as the final stage of performance management starting with performance reporting to awards or sanctions (Gurning & Sugiri, 2017) [16]. The following are the results of research on the indicator of Follow-Up on Performance Evaluation Results obtained from observations and interviews in Langapan which have been processed by researchers:

**Table 5.** Research Findings on the Indicator of Follow-up on Performance Evaluation Results

<b>Indicator</b>	<b>Findings</b>
Follow-up on Performance Evaluation Results	Follow-up on the results of performance evaluation is carried out by giving verbal appreciation to employees who have SKP scores with good predicates and reprimands to employees with sufficient predicates. Performance reporting is carried out by entering SKP documents in the development field.

*Source: data processed by researchers (2024)*

Based on the results of the research, it was found that the follow-up to the results of the performance evaluation was carried out by giving verbal appreciation to employees who had good SKP scores and reprimanding employees who had sufficient scores. So it can be seen that the award as a follow-up to the results of the performance evaluation at the Staffing and HR Development Agency of East Bolaang Mongondow Regency has been carried out quite well, the award given in the form of verbal appreciation to civil servants with good performance is a positive encouragement for these civil servants to further improve their performance, this is supported by the opinion of Sinambela (2021) which states that the final stage of positive encouragement is to give praise or reward according to their performance which is a very important stage, the award given in the form of praise must be specific and not too general [13].

In the implementation of performance reporting has not been carried out in accordance with the Regulation of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform Number 6 of 2022, it can be seen based on the findings in the field, most of the interviewees did not know that the performance evaluation document signed by the appraisal official was submitted to the appraised employee no later than 14 working days after it was signed.

If the performance appraisal official does not sign the performance evaluation document, the appraisal official's superior signs the evaluation document within 14 working days of the end of the evaluation period, and the signed document is delivered to the appraised employee within 7 working days of receipt. The employee who receives the evaluation document returns it to the superior performance appraisal official within 7 working days of receipt. The appraised employee may submit objections to the evaluation results along with the reasons in stages to the performance appraisal official no later than 14 working days after the document is received. The superior appraisal official determines the decision on the objection no later than 7 working days. The evaluation document has not been used as a reference in identifying and planning education / training needs, competency development, provision of benefits, consideration of mutations and promotions, as well as follow-up on problems in the performance evaluation document, this can cause employees with good performance not to be motivated to maintain or improve their performance because these employees will assume that what is obtained as a form of appreciation for their performance is not much different from employees whose performance is mediocre which will affect the achievement of organizational targets and goals.

#### **D. Conclusion**

Based on the description of the previous chapter, it is concluded that the Performance Management of State Civil Apparatus at the Civil Service Agency and Human Resources Development has not been carried out optimally, it was found that the stages of performance management, namely performance planning which includes setting and clarifying expectations, implementing, monitoring, and fostering employee performance which includes documenting

performance, providing continuous feedback, and employee performance development, employee performance appraisal which includes employee performance evaluation and follow-up on Performance Evaluation Results in its implementation by performance appraisal officials and assessed employees has not been carried out in accordance with the guidelines based on the Regulation of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform Number 6 of 2022 concerning Performance Management of State Civil Apparatus Employees. This is due to a lack of understanding from performance appraisal officials and employees who are assessed regarding the implementation of the performance management stages of the State Civil Apparatus.

The recommendation of this research is for the Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency of East Bolaang Mongondow Regency to carry out socialization and training on State Civil Apparatus performance management, so that every State Civil Apparatus in the Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency of East Bolaang Mongondow Regency knows how to implement performance management in accordance with the Regulation of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform Number 6 of 2022 concerning Performance Management of State Civil Apparatus Employees.

## References

- [1] M. P. A. N. dan R. B. R. Indonesia, "Peraturan Menteri Pendayagunaan Aparatur Negara dan Reformasi Birokrasi Republik Indonesia Nomor 6 Tahun 2022 tentang Pengelolaan Kinerja Pegawai Aparatur Sipil Negara." Kementerian Hukum dan Hak Asasi Manusia Republik Indonesia, Jakarta, 2022.
- [2] P. R. Indonesia, "Undang-Undang Nomor 20 Tahun 2023 tentang Aparatur Sipil Negara." Sekretariat Negara Republik Indonesia, Jakarta, 2023.
- [3] T. Kristiana, "Penerapan profile matching untuk penilaian kinerja pegawai negeri sipil (PNS)," *J. Pilar Nusa Mandiri*, vol. 11, no. 2, pp. 161–170, 2015.
- [4] K. Bolaang Mongondow Timur, "Peraturan Bupati Kabupaten Bolaang Mongondow Timur Nomor 8 Tahun 2023 tentang Kedudukan, Susunan, Organisasi, Tugas dan Fungsi Serta Tata Kerja Perangkat Daerah." Pemerintah Daerah Kabupaten Bolaang Mongondow Timur, Bolaang Mongondow Timur, 2023.
- [5] T. Wawointana, I. Pangkey, and J. Langkay, "The Performance of Bureaucrats in Public Services," in *International Conference on Social Science 2019 (ICSS 2019)*, Atlantis Press, 2019, pp. 660–668.
- [6] M. Mandagi, J. Mantiri, and V. T. Mewengkang, "Public Service Arrives Departure Through the Integrated Licensing Service Information System in Making Nurse Practice Permits (Study at the Manado City Investment and One-stop Integrated Service Office)," *KnE Soc. Sci.*, pp. 374–384, 2023, doi: <https://doi.org/10.18502/kss.v8i5.13011>.
- [7] S. Kairupan and M. Mandagi, "Peningkatan Kapasitas Aparatur dalam Pengelolaan Administrasi," *Daya Sains J. Pengabd. Kpd. Masy.*, vol. 2, no. 1, 2019.
- [8] A. Rajab, H. Kusmanto, and A. Adam, "Implementasi Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 30 Tahun 2019 Tentang Penilaian Kinerja PNS di Sekretariat Daerah, Subulussalam," *J. Educ. Hum. Soc. Sci.*, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 1630–1640, 2022.
- [9] W. Idawati, "Perencanaan Strategik Untuk Tercapainya Akuntabilitas Kinerja Instansi Pemerintah," *J. Akunt. Bisnis*, vol. 3, no. 2, 2017.
- [10] E. Sinambela and K. R. A. P. R. Ana, "Analisis Kinerja Anggaran Pendapatan dan Belanja Daerah Pada Pemerintah Provinsi Sumatera Utara," *J. Ris. Akunt. dan Bisnis*, vol. 16, no. 1, 2016.

- [11] S. E. Nubatonis, S. Rusmiwari, and S. Suwasono, “Implementasi prinsip-prinsip good governance dalam meningkatkan kinerja organisasi pelayanan publik,” *J. Ilmu Sos. dan Ilmu Polit.*, vol. 3, no. 1, 2015, doi: <https://doi.org/10.33366/jisip.v3i1.68>.
- [12] W. Bogar, “The effect of transactional leadership and transformational leadership on employees creativity,” *Asia Pacific J. Manag. Educ.*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 64–70, 2019.
- [13] L. P. Sinambela, *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia: Membangun tim kerja yang solid untuk meningkatkan kinerja*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara, 2021.
- [14] R. H. E. Sendouw, E. M. C. Lumingkewas, B. F. Supit, and P. M. M. Kapojos, “Analysis of Performance Appraisal of State Civil Apparatus in the Regional Office of Education of North Sulawesi Province,” *Tech. Soc. Sci. J.*, vol. 49, pp. 90–96, 2023, doi: <https://doi.org/10.47577/tssj.v49i1.9785>.
- [15] D. Djadjuli, “Pelaksanaan pengawasan oleh pimpinan dalam meningkatkan kinerja pegawai,” *Din. J. Ilm. Ilmu Adm. Negara*, vol. 4, no. 4, pp. 565–573, 2018.
- [16] C. R. A. Gurning and S. Sugiri, “Analisis Faktor-Faktor Penghambat Tindak Lanjut Saran Perbaikan Kinerja atas Laporan Hasil Evaluasi Akuntabilitas Kinerja pada Pemerintah Daerah Kabupaten Klaten,” *ABIS Account. Bus. Inf. Syst. J.*, vol. 5, no. 3, 2017.