



**TECHNIUM**  
**SOCIAL SCIENCES JOURNAL**

**Vol. 22, 2021**

**A new decade  
for social changes**

[www.techniumscience.com](http://www.techniumscience.com)

ISSN 2668-7798



9 772668 779000

## **Human Resources Competence in The Field of Tourism Destination Development Tomohon City Tourism Department**

**Angel P. M. Robot<sup>1</sup>, Sisca Beatrix Kairupan<sup>2</sup>, Marthinus Mandagi<sup>3</sup>**

<sup>1 2 3</sup> Public Administration Program of Magister Program of Manado State University

[Precilliaangel@gmail.com](mailto:Precilliaangel@gmail.com), [siscakairupan@unima.ac.id](mailto:siscakairupan@unima.ac.id),  
[marthinusmandagi@unima.ac.id](mailto:marthinusmandagi@unima.ac.id)

**Abstract.** The success of implementing programs and activities of a government agency to achieve the maximum target and by the desired output is primarily determined by one of the supporting components in a government agency, namely the competence of human resources. This study aims to examine and describe the Competence of Human Resources at the Department of Tourism for the Development of Tourism Destinations in the City of Tomohon, Section of Tourism Destination Management. The author uses indicators that characterize Knowledge Competence, i.e., skill and Behaviours of performance that can be observed, measured, and evaluated. The research method used is a qualitative approach with data collection techniques through observation, interviews, and documentation. Data analysis used an interactive model with data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing. The results of this study are that Human Resources in the Tourism Destination Governance Section have competence in carrying out the duties and functions of tourism destination governance in Tomohon City.

**Keywords.** Competence, Skills, Knowledge, Performance Behaviour

### **A. Introduction**

The contribution of tourism has a broad dimension, not only economically but also socio-politically, culturally, regionally, and environmentally. Economically, the tourism sector makes a real contribution to the country's foreign exchange earnings, regional original income/PAD, and community income created from developed tourism businesses and opens up vast employment opportunities and high employment. Socio-politically, tourism development fosters pride in the nation's natural and cultural wealth. Through the growth of domestic tourism travel, tourism is also effective in growing and strengthening a sense of love for the homeland and national unity and integrity. Socio-culturally, the growing world recognition of Indonesia's natural and cultural wealth has also raised national pride and, at the same time, has become an effective tool of cultural diplomacy to strengthen Indonesia's image in the international arena.

Furthermore, regionally, tourism, which has a multi-sectoral and cross-regional character, is concretely and effectively able to encourage tourism infrastructure and facilities, which drives the flow of investment and regional development [1]. As a province with a very significant tourism object, North Sulawesi has had a powerful influence on tourist visits both domestically and internationally, which directly has an incredible economic impact on the people of North Sulawesi Province [2]. Tomohon is one city support adjacent to the capital city

of Manado. North Sulawesi province has a strategic position as a transit city or buffers for Manado. This means that when a traveler visits Manado city or other areas, the Tomohon has merit in multiple- effects. Tomohon city can be a transit city for tourists who visit other areas whose transportation routes pass through the city of Tomohon [3]. Like a city transit city, Tomohon also has many other advantages that have the tourist attraction provided by nature is nature tourism.

The large number of tourism potentials owned by the city of Tomohon is undoubtedly something to be grateful for. However, along with the development of the city of Tomohon, the new tourism destinations in the city of Tomohon today, if we examine further, are primarily developed and managed by the private sector. New tourist destinations developed and managed by the private sector in terms of quantity and quality are very different from those managed by the Government. In terms of quality, new tourist destinations managed by the private sector are better than those managed by the Government. Problems arise and become public questions about the problem in managing tourism destinations in the city of Tomohon. Whereas in terms of development, tourism destinations managed by the private sector are more developed than those managed by the Tomohon City Government.

The management of tourism destinations that belong to the Tomohon City Government is under the authority of the Tourism Office, in this case, the Tourism Destinations Governance Section. Governance issues related to tourism destinations is an issue that must find a solution by the Government of Tomohon, particularly the Department of Tourism, as stakeholders who have responsibility for managing tourism destinations owned by the Government. The governance of tourism destinations is closely related to the duties and functions of the Tourism Office of the Tourism Destination Management Section as stated in the Tomohon Mayor Regulation Number 38 of 2016 concerning the Elaboration of the Main Duties and Functions of the Organizational Structure of the Tomohon City Tourism Office. In terms of performing the functions of governance of tourism destinations, the problem that always comes up is related to the competency of human resources as the operator in the management of tourism destinations. Competence is the main requirement and must be possessed by people or employees directly involved in managing existing tourism destinations. This means that in carrying out tasks and functions related to the management of tourism destinations, human resources must have ideal competencies and meet the requirements needed in managing tourism destinations.

The competence of human resources is the main factor in carrying out the tasks and functions of tourism destination governance. Competence is everything that someone in the form of knowledge owns. The skill factor for other individuals to grind the work is based on knowledge and skills. Competence in question is a characteristic of competence; namely, knowledge is information that is owned or controlled by a person in a particular field; Skills, Expertise, or ability to do something well; and Behavior (Attitude) is a person's response or reaction to external stimuli or stimuli so that it can be concluded that the issue of human resource competence can be a factor in the success of an agency in carrying out programs that are the duties and authorities so that it can be implemented and achieve maximum output in quantity and quality.

## **B. Theoretical review**

### **1. Human Resource Management**

According to Gauzali, management is an activity that must be carried out by organizations so that their knowledge, abilities, and skills are by the demands of the work they are doing. Another opinion about the definition of human resource management, according to

Edwin B. Filippo, is related to planning, organizing, directing, and controlling the procurement, development, compensation, integration, maintenance, and termination of employees to realize the goals of individual companies employees, and society [4]. Thus in Susan's opinion that the definition or understanding of human resource management itself is a matter related to the utilization of humans in doing a job to achieve the maximum level of effectiveness and efficiency in realizing the goals to be achieved in the company, an employee and also community. Human resources are an integrated ability of the individual's thinking power and physical power, the behavior and nature determined by heredity and the environment. At the same time, work performance is motivated by the desire to fulfill his satisfaction [5]. Human resources are assets in all aspects of management, especially those concerning the organization's existence [6]. Human resources are the potential in humans to realize their role as adaptive and transformative social beings who can manage themselves and all the potentials in nature towards achieving the welfare of life in a balanced and sustainable order [7]. In simple, practical terms, HR is better understood as an integral part of the system that makes up an organization [8]. Human resource management is a process of dealing with various problems within the scope of employees, employees, laborers, managers, and other workers to support the activities of an organization or company to achieve predetermined goals [9]. Human Resource Management has another concept of thought: the development and use of personnel (employees) to achieve individual, organizational, community, national, and international goals and objectives [10]. It can also be defined as the process of efforts to recruit, develop, motivate, and evaluate the overall human resources needed by the company in achieving its goals [11][12].

## **2. Human Resources Competence**

Human Resource is a separate asset of an organization itself. The successful implementation of tasks or programs of an organization is determined by the quality of the organization's human resources. If the quality of Human Resources has adequate capabilities or has good competence, then directly the programs that have been prepared for implementation will run well because of the capabilities possessed by the Resources of an Organization. Competence is defined as a description of what must be known or done to carry out the job well. Some definitions of competence are as follows. Sedarmayanti defines competence as a fundamental characteristic possessed by a person who directly affects or can predict excellent performance [13]. Malthis and Jackson define that competence as the essential characteristic that can be associated with increased performance of individuals or teams. Meanwhile, in the definition put forward by Prihadi regarding the main components of competence, a set of interrelated knowledge, skills, and attitudes that affect most positions (roles or responsibilities), correlates with performance in those positions, and can be measured by acceptable standards, and can be improved through training and development efforts. Hutapea and Thoha argue four main components of competence: knowledge owned by a person, ability, experience, and individual behavior. In general, competence can also be interpreted as a combination of skills, personal attributes, and knowledge reflected through behavior performance (job behavior) that can be observed, measured, and evaluated [14].

In the context of using competence is a measuring tool for one's ability. Conceptually, there is a difference between the Competence Concept, namely the American Concept and the British Concept [15]. British concept Competence is used in the workplace in various ways. Training is often competency-based, and the National Council Vocational Qualification (NCVQ) system is based on competency standards. Reward management where payments are made based on competence. According to the Decree of the Head of the Civil Service Agency

Number: 46A of 2005 concerning the definition of competence, it is “Abilities and characteristics possessed by a Civil Servant in the form of knowledge, skills, and behavioral attitudes required in carrying out their duties, so that the Civil Servant can carry out his duties as a civil servant. Official, effective and efficient. Competence is the skills and knowledge that come from the social and work environment that are absorbed, mastered, and used as an instrument to create value by carrying out tasks and work and possible.

According to Boulter, Dalziel, and Hill, competence is an essential characteristic of a person that allows him to provide superior performance in a particular job, role, or situation. Meanwhile, Mulyasa defines competence as a combination of knowledge, skills, values, and attitudes reflected in the habits of thinking and acting [16]. Frinch and Crunkilton define competence as mastery of a task, attitude, and appreciation needed to support success [17]. From the above understanding, it can be concluded that competence is an essential trait that is owned or part of a deep and attached personality to a person and predictable behavior in various situations and work tasks as an encouragement to have achievements and the desire to try to carry out tasks effectively [18]. Competence is defined as the ability to perform work roles by the standards set concerning the work environment [19]. In general, competence can be understood as a combination of skills, personal attributes, and knowledge reflected through job behavior observed, measured, and evaluated [20][21].

### **3. Tourism Destination Development**

The development of the world of tourism is currently so fast that it opens up opportunities for the Government to develop tourism destinations in potential areas [22]. Some of the reasons for the increasing growth of World Tourism are 1. Increase in Destinations and Improvement of Facilities and Infrastructure that support the development and growth of the tourism industry in Indonesia and countries in the Asia Pacific several times from year to year. 2. The increase in population mobility from one place to another within the country and between countries in the Asia Pacific is relatively high. 3. Advances in communication technology (cyber technology) and the rapid dissemination of information through the internet and other communication media. 4. The extraordinarily rapid growth/development of information and communication technology has stimulated the rapid growth of the tourism, event, and MICE industry. 5. The spread of knowledge through seminars, congresses, conferences, and exhibitions of new products and very tight competition has also spurred this industry to become unstoppable [23].

Based on the Attachment to the Regulation of the Minister of Tourism of the Republic of Indonesia Number 14 of 2016. It concerning Guidelines for Sustainable Tourism Destinations, Letter D number 8 states that Tourism Destinations after this referred to as Tourism Destinations, are geographical areas located within one or more administrative areas in which there are tourist attractions, public facilities, tourism facilities, accessibility, and communities that are interrelated and complement the realization of tourism [24]. Tourism development is developed with an approach to economic growth and equity for people’s welfare and development-oriented to regional development, community-based and empowering the community, which includes various aspects, such as human resources, marketing, destinations, science and technology, cross-sectoral linkages, cooperation between countries, empowerment of small businesses, and responsibility for the utilization of natural and cultural resources Tourism Destination Criteria are divided into four parts: a. Sustainable Tourism Destination Management; b. economic utilization for local communities; c. cultural preservation for the community and visitors; and D. environmental preservation [25]. In terms of carrying out the Development of Effective Tourism Destinations, the Government of Indonesia has made

guidelines for the Government based on existing regulations through the Ministry of Tourism [26]. The management and development of the destination as intended must consist of Planning, Management, Monitoring, and Evaluation [27]

The development includes, first, a sustainable destination strategy. The existence of a multi-year tourism strategy (short, medium, and long term) which includes the development of accessibility to destinations, tourism amenities in and around the destination, tourism activities in and around the destination while taking into account the capacity and carrying capacity of the environment, economic growth, social issues, cultural heritage, quality, health, safety and aesthetics [28]. The formulation of the strategy is carried out with community participation and political commitment from relevant stakeholders. Second, there is an effective management organization, coordinated, with transparent funding and division of tasks. It also involves the private and public sectors, which are under the existing legal basis. Third, a monitoring and evaluation system that is implemented and reported regularly. The system covers environmental, economic, social, cultural, tourism, and human rights issues and tourism impact mitigation procedures that are well-functioning and funded. Fourth, there are strategies and resources to identify tourism opportunities throughout the year to balance the economic and local community, cultural and environmental needs. Therefore, proper and precise marketing strategies are needed, including creating a calendar of annual tourism events/activities [29].

Fifth, a tourism standard system regulates essential aspects of sustainable tourism activities for tourism actors, such as tourism area managers, hotels, homestays, tour operators, etc. This system is expected to run consistently in applying the criteria for sustainable tourism. Business actors who have received certification are published to the public. To six, promotion destinations, products, and tourism services done accurately, authentically responsible, and respectful of the local community and tourists [30]. Thus, a reference or road map must be met as required and has become a legal basis for the Government or Stakeholders who will carry out tourism development in their respective regions. Seventh, there is a policy to support access to tourist sites, natural and cultural sites for all, including people with disabilities or those with special needs, as long as this is appropriate to implement [31]. Eighth, there is an emergency response management, including an action plan prepared by taking into account input from the private sector, explaining human and financial resources, and communication procedures during and after a crisis/emergency occurs. Ninth, there are guidelines, regulations, policies regarding planning that include environmental, economic, social impact assessment, zoning, land use, design, construction, and demolition, which are prepared together with local communities to protect natural and cultural resources. These guidelines, regulations, policies are communicated openly, and law enforcement is implemented [32].

### **C. Research Methods**

The method used in this research is qualitative. This type of qualitative research does not have a standard design or procedure as in experimental research. The procedure for qualitative research can be illustrated as an inverted funnel pyramid, which means that research progresses from the general to the specific. Another illustration is a spiral that describes qualitative research going from general to more specific data collection. In addition, the spiral shows the iterative cycle of observation and analysis. In descriptive qualitative research, the data collected is in the form of words or descriptions from the informants. The results of his writings contain interview excerpts from informants used to explain and strengthen the presentation of data in the results and discussion sections. Research data includes interviews, field notes, photography, and documents. In general, in qualitative research, data collection is done on the primary data source condition. In general, there are four data collection techniques,

namely observation, interviews, and documentation. Observable data can be in the form of a description of attitudes, behavior, behavior, actions, overall interactions between humans [33].

Furthermore, the data that has been collected is processed and analyzed in a descriptive-qualitative manner, namely presenting the data in detail and carrying out theoretical interpretations so that an adequate description and conclusion can be obtained. Interviews were conducted on informants conducted directly in interviews in the form of questions and answers with informants. The technique of collecting data with documentation is the retrieval of data obtained through documents. Data analysis in qualitative research systematically searches and compiles data obtained from interviews, field notes, and documentation by organizing data into categories, describing them into units, synthesizing, compiling into patterns, choosing which ones to use. Important and what will be learned. Moreover, make conclusions so that they are easily understood by themselves and others [34]. According to Mathew B. Miles and Michael Huberman, in qualitative analysis, the data that appears in the form of words and not a series of numbers in the form of involved observations, interviews, and then processed through recording, recording, typing, using words that are usually arranged into text that expanded [35]. The data analysis according to the Miles and Huberman model is as follows.

1. **Data Reduction** Reducing data means summarizing, choosing the main things, focusing on the essential things, looking for themes and patterns, and discarding unnecessary ones. Thus the data that has been reduced provides more precise data and makes it easier for the author to carry out further data collection.
2. **Data Display** After the data is reduced, the next step is to display or present the data. The goal is to simplify information, from complex information to simple information. So easy to understand the meaning
3. **Conclusion Drawing/Verification**, The third step in analyzing qualitative data is drawing conclusions and verification, according to Miles and Huberman. In concluding by observing and using the developed mindset. Drawing conclusions from the results of this study answered all the problem formulations that the research had determined.

The data presented in the form of a description are interviews related to implementing Tourism Destination Development in Tomohon City conducted by the Tourism Destination Development Division of the Tomohon City Tourism Office. The types and sources of data obtained in the field are primary data and interviews regarding research.

## **D. Results and Discussion**

### **1. Human Resources Competence in the Tourism Destination Governance Section**

The running of the work system of an agency or institution, one of which depends on the Human Resources in the agency itself. As a directly integrated subject in an organizational system, the Human Resources in it work based on the work system and human resources competencies. Planning a sound work system must begin with planning or good human resource management. This means that the placement of human resources in question is based on the competencies possessed by employees. It has a positive impact on achieving the output that is the agency's goal. According to Flipppo: "Personnel management is the planning organizing, directing, and controlling of the procurement, development, compensation, integration, and maintenance of the people to contribute to organizational, individual and societal goals" That is, personnel management is related to the system of planning, organizing, directing and supervising the activities of procurement, development, compensation, integration, and maintenance of employees in order to achieve various individual, organizational, and community goals [13]. Producing competent human resources amid the limited number and competence possessed by an agency must be based on planning to get maximum results. The

urgency of planning to get Human Resources by the competencies required by an agency aims to increase excellence or increase the ability of human resources within the agency itself. According to Bernadin and Russell, human resource planning is forecasting human resource needs. While Walker stated that human resource planning, broadly defined, analyses human resource needs in changing conditions and developing activities or activities necessary to meet those needs [14].

Planning for Human Resource Needs as carried out by the Tomohon City Tourism Destination Development Sector when obtaining limited human resources in terms of number and competence possessed by the tourism destination management section is maximizing the competence of available employees. This can be seen in the achievement of program results that can be implemented and by the targets desired by the agency. This is in line with what was stated by Sutrisno regarding the functions of human resource management itself, namely: Planning, Organizing, Directing and Procurement, Controlling, Development, Compensation, Integration, Discipline, and Termination. Human resource competence is an indicator that determines whether or not the program implementation of an agency is implemented. Competence is a skill that a person needs, which is demonstrated by his ability to consistently provide an adequate or high level of performance in a specific job function. Thus, the consistency shown by the employee becomes a determining factor when the person concerned is carrying out his duties and authorities, which can provide added value for the agency in which he is assigned. In general, competencies are divided into two soft competencies or types of competencies closely related to managing work processes and human relationships and building interactions with other people. Soft competencies are leadership, communication, interpersonal relations, and complex competency competencies related to a job's functional or technical abilities. K Competency relates to the technical intricacies associated with busy work.

The demand for the management of tourism destinations is so remarkable considering that the tourism destinations owned by the Tomohon City government if managed optimally, can provide added value economically for regional income and provide income to the community around tourism destinations. In managing tourism destinations, employees with good competence are needed to achieve the target results by the desired results. Employees who carry out management must have a competent or good character to carry out the work to be carried out. According to Rudman in Bukit, the essential characteristics of competence are the ability to describe the primary skills that can produce an adequate performance at the individual work level, provide a structured way to describe behavior and provide the organization with a shared understanding, provide a framework for and a clear focus on hiring, appraisal, performance reviews and training, on future performance [20].

Cover in Enny argues that the competencies possessed by a person or employee include Technical Competence, namely knowledge, and expertise, to achieve agreed results, the ability to think about problems and find new alternatives. Conceptual Competencies, namely the ability to see the big picture to test assumptions and change perspectives and Competence to Live in Dependence Ability to interact effectively with others, including the ability to hear, communicate, find alternatives, and see and operate effectively in an organization or system that intact. According to Sedarmayanti in Enny, competence is a combination of knowledge, skills, and behavior used to improve performance or circumstances or qualities that are adequate or of very high quality, having the ability to perform specific roles. The competencies possessed by employees in the tourism destination governance section can be measured through competency indicators, namely Knowledge, Ability, and Work Behaviour (Job Behaviour). With competence characteristics as referred to above, they can carry out their main tasks and functions [21].

Based on the results of the discussion carried out, it was found that the tourism destination management section had attempted to carry out their main tasks and functions, namely to manage tourism destinations to the maximum by the following competency characteristics:

## **2. Knowledge**

It can be seen that the knowledge of the tourism destination governance section employees is obtained individually through searching for information in the tourism destination governance section to be later studied as part of upgrading knowledge independently and through activities carried out by external parties such as Bimtek and Training. Based on the results of upgrading independently and through training and technical guidance carried out by external parties, employees of the tourism destination management section, in the end, get complete knowledge about tourism, regulations governing tourism, and technical management of tourism destinations. The output obtained through good knowledge of the regulations governing the primary duties and functions of the tourism destination governance section is ultimately able to make employees in the tourism destination governance section able to implement it when they manage tourism destinations so that they run by applicable regulations.

## **3. Skills**

As the knowledge is possessed by the supervisor of the tourism destination management section. Their skills are also acquired through technical training and technical guidance that they participate in. With the technical skills possessed, they can produce good outputs, namely the achievement of targets and work programs that can be implemented. The technical skills they have enabled employees to implement them in their technical work, namely managing tourism destinations. The results achieved are the percentage of achieving the target for implementing the destination governance section program to reach the target maximally.

## **4. Performance Behaviour**

Good performance behavior has been shown by employees of the tourism destination governance section. That they have a solid motivation to complete their tasks and responsibilities to the fullest. Attitude loyal to the boss and work showed by carrying out the duties without any remonstrance against a supervisor on a given workload and fostering good relationships with fellow employees and stakeholders to coordinate between superiors and subordinates to run well. The tourism destination management section shows that they have carried out the main tasks and functions of tourism destination governance to the fullest because they have competency characters, namely Knowledge, Ability, and good work behavior. Good work behavior results in implementing the main tasks and functions correctly and regularly because it is based on good coordination between superiors and subordinates in the tourism destination governance section.

## **E. Conclusion**

Based on the results of research and discussion, it can be concluded that the competence of employees in tourism destination development in the tourism destination governance section is as follows: (1). Knowledge governance employee section on tourism destinations obtained individually and through training and technical assistance carried out by external parties provide additional knowledge for them when managing tourism destinations according to Mayor Regulation No 38 2016. (2). Employees' tourism destination governance section skills allow

them to carry out tourism destination management optimally and achieve the targets. The skills possessed can be maximized by employees to optimally manage tourism destinations, as evidenced by the maximum percentage of target achievement. Behaviour, The performance of employees in the governance section of tourism destinations, has an attitude of loyalty to their superiors and work. It is shown that both among fellow employees to coordinate because they have competence are knowledge, ability, and behavior. Good performance behavior produces good output and the successful implementation of the tourism destination governance section program.

## References

- [1] S. B. Kairupan and R. H. E. Sendouw, 'Analysis of tourism management development of the Bunaken National Marine Park', in *Issues and Trends in Interdisciplinary Behavior and Social Science: Proceedings of the 6th International Congress on Interdisciplinary Behavior and Social Sciences (ICIBSoS 2017), July 22-23, 2017, Bali, Indonesia*, 2018, p. 289.
- [2] S. B. Kairupan, 'Privatisasi Sektor Pariwisata, (Studi Kasus implementasi Kebijakan Privatisasi pada Obyek Wisata Bahari Taman Laut Bunaken, di Kota Manado Provinsi Sulawesi Utara', Universitas Brawijaya Malang, 2001.
- [3] M. M. Mandagi, J. Mantiri, and S. B. Kairupan, 'Implementation of Smart Governance in Realizing Tomohon Smart City', in *Iapa Proceedings Conference*, 2020, pp. 437–448.
- [4] Zabalza, K., & Matey, J., "Privatisation and changes in human resource management: evidence from Spain," *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, vol. 22, no. 8, pp. 1741–1764, 2011.
- [5] Shen, J., "Developing the concept of socially responsible international human resource management. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*," vol. 22, no. 6, pp. 1351–1363, 2011.
- [6] Waterhouse, J., & Keast, R., "Strategizing Public Sector Human Resource Management: The Implications of Working in Networks," *International Journal of Public Administration*, vol. 35, no. 8, pp. 562–576, 2012.
- [7] Guo, C., & Al Ariss, A. "Human resource management of international migrants: current theories and future research," *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, vol. 26, no. 10, pp. 1287–1297, 2015.
- [8] Veronika Kabalina, Olga Zelenova & Kira Reshetnikova. "Contemporary Human Resource Management Practices in Russia: Flexibility under Uncertainty, *International Studies of Management & Organization*," vol. 49, no. 4, pp. 422-440, 2019.
- [9] Baran, B. E., Filipkowski, J. N., & Stockwell, R. A., "Organizational Change: Perspectives From Human Resource Management," *Journal of Change Management*, vol. 19 no. 3, pp. 1–19, 2018.
- [10] García-Lillo, F., Úbeda-García, M., & Marco-Lajara, B., "The intellectual structure of human resource management research: a bibliometric study of the international journal of human resource management, 2000–2012," *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, vol. 28, no. 13, pp. 1786–1815, 2016.
- [11] Del Prado, F. L. E., & Rosellon, M. A. D., "Developing technological capability through human resource management: case study from the Philippines," *Asian Journal of Technology Innovation*, vol. 25, no. 2, pp. 310–329, 2017.

- [12] Shen, J., Messersmith, J. G., & Jiang, K., "Advancing human resource management scholarship through multilevel modeling. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, vol. 29, no. 2, pp. 227–238, 2017.
- [13] Gilbert, M. B., "Human Performance Technology: Further Reflections on Human Competence," *Journal of Organizational Behavior Management*, vol. 39, no. 1-2, pp. 7–112, 2019.
- [14] Schutte, N., Barkhuizen, N., & van der Sluis, L., "The development of a human resource management HRM professional competence model: A pilot study," *Journal of Psychology in Africa*, vol. 26, no. 3, pp. 230–236, 2016.
- [15] Ollila, S., "Productivity in Public Welfare Services is Changing: The Standpoint of Strategic Competence-Based Management," *Social Work in Public Health*, vol. 28, no. 6, pp. 566–574, 2013.
- [15] Parish, K., "A measure of human rights competence in students enrolled on the International Baccalaureate Diploma Programme," *Oxford Review of Education*, vol. 45, no. 3, pp. 390–404, 2019.
- [16] Quigley, D., "Building Cultural Competence in Environmental Studies and Natural Resource Sciences," *Society & Natural Resources*, vol. 29, no. 6, pp. 725–737, 2015.
- [17] Wattanacharoensil, W., & Yoopetch, C., "Thailand's Human Resource Competencies in Airline Service Quality: Voices from the Airline Industry," *Journal of Human Resources in Hospitality & Tourism*, vol. 11, no. 4, pp. 280–302, 2012.
- [18] Migdadi, M. M., & Abu Zaid, M. K. S., "An empirical investigation of knowledge management competence for enterprise resource planning systems success: insights from Jordan," *International Journal of Production Research*, vol. 54, no. 18, pp. 5480–5498, 2016.
- [19] PB, S., "Developing human resource competencies: an empirical evidence," *Human Resource Development International*, vol. 22, no. 4, pp. 343–363, 2019.
- [20] Kim, T.-Y., & Liu, Z., "Taking charge and employee outcomes: the moderating effect of emotional competence," *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, vol. 28, no. 5, pp. 775–793, 2015.
- [21] Ali, A., "Innovation and Tourism Destination Development," *Tourism Planning & Development*, vol. 13, no. 1, pp. 123–125, 2015.
- [22] Cavalheiro, M. B., Joia, L. A., & Cavalheiro, G. M. do C., "Towards a Smart Tourism Destination Development Model: Promoting Environmental, Economic, Socio-cultural and Political Values. *Tourism Planning & Development*, pp. 1–23, 2019.
- [23] Kemenpar, "Peraturan Menteri Pariwisata Republik Indonesia Nomor 14 Tahun 2016 Tentang Pedoman Destinasi Pariwisata Berkelanjutan." Peraturan Menteri Pariwisata:1–64, 2016.
- [24] Pariwisata, Kementerian, "Laporan Akuntabilitas Kinerja Kemeterian Pariwisata 2018." *Laporan Kinerja Kementerian Pariwisata Tahun 2018*, vol. 53, no. 9, pp. 1689–99, 2018.
- [25] Saarinen, J., "Enclavic tourism spaces: territorialization and bordering in tourism destination development and planning," *Tourism Geographies*, vol. 19, no. 3, pp. 425–437, 2016.
- [26] Halkier, H., "Innovation and Destination Governance in Denmark: Tourism, Policy Networks and Spatial Development," *European Planning Studies*, vol. 22, no. 8, pp. 1659–1670, 2013.
- [27] Kozak, M. W., "Innovation, Tourism and Destination Development: Dolnośląskie Case Study," *European Planning Studies*, vol. 22, no. 8, pp. 1604–1624, 2013.

- [27] Olsen, L. S., "Sami tourism in destination development: conflict and collaboration," *Polar Geography*, vol. 39, no. 3, pp. 179–195, 2016.
- [28] Kuščer, K., Mihalič, T., & Pechlaner, H., "Innovation, sustainable tourism and environments in mountain destination development: a comparative analysis of Austria," *Slovenia and Switzerland. Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, vol. 25, no. 4, pp. 489–504, 2016.
- [29] Serdane, Z., "Slow Philosophy in Tourism Development in Latvia: The Supply Side Perspective," *Tourism Planning & Development*, vol. 17, no. 3, pp. 1–18, 2019.
- [30] Barbini, F. M., & Presutti, M., "Transforming a peripheral area in an emerging tourism destination," *Tourism Geographies*, vol. 16, no. 2, pp. 190–206, 2014.
- [31] Arntsen, H., & Waldrop, A., "Introduction to Special Issue: Qualitative Method/ologies in Development Studies," *Forum for Development Studies*, vol. 45, no. 2, pp. 185–189, 2018.
- [32] Kabbanji, J., "Superiority and Banality of the Qualitative Method: The Analytic Induction of Jack Katz. Méthodes," *African Review of Social Sciences Methodology*, vol. 1, no. 1-2, pp. 147–154, 2015.
- [33] Varvin, S., "The essay method" a qualitative method for studying therapeutic dialogues," *The Scandinavian Psychoanalytic Review*, vol. 42, no. 1, pp. 1–11, 2019.