



TECHNIUM
SOCIAL SCIENCES JOURNAL

Vol. 26, 2021

**A new decade
for social changes**

www.techniumscience.com

ISSN 2668-7798



9 772668 779000

The Role of Service Quality in Increasing Tourist Satisfaction: A Case Study at Taman Mini Indonesia Indah Jakarta

Sukarni Novita Sari

STIAMI- Institute of Social Sciences and Management, Jakarta-Indonesia

Abstract. This study aims to answer questions about why there are many tourists complained regarding the services provided in TMII and how are the strategies to improve the quality of services so that tourists feel satisfied. This research is a qualitative research with a case study approach. Data was collected through semi-structured interviews and in a fluid atmosphere. In this study, interviews were conducted with 10 tourists, consisting of 8 domestic tourists and 2 tourists from the Netherlands. Interview was also conducted with an academic to obtain information on how changes should be made in terms of improving service quality with the aim of increasing tourist satisfaction. The result of this study shows that to improve the service quality of a tourist destination, the 5 elements must be considered namely reliability, responsiveness, assurance, empathy, and tangibles and to increase the tourist satisfaction, the following elements must be improved namely the facilities and infrastructure, activities or programs for tourists, convenience, shopping, entertainment, special events such as performing arts/festivals, cultural/heritage, supporting factors, quality of service, accessibility of destinations and prices.

Keywords. Service quality, tourist satisfaction, Taman Mini Indonesia Indah

1. Introduction

Indonesia as the largest archipelagic country in the world has extraordinary tourism potential and is a major destination for domestic and foreign tourists. Therefore, it is appropriate if the tourism sector is made the main sector of the national economy. Foreign exchange obtained by Indonesia from the tourism sector in 2018 reached 19.2 billion USD. The development of Indonesian tourism which is growing rapidly is very influential on foreign exchange and gross domestic product. Progress in the tourism sector has also opened up employment opportunities in related sectors. With the rapid progress in the tourism industry, it is easier to invite tourists and also to attract investment.¹

However, in order to achieve our goal of attracting tourists and investors, it must be balanced with good service quality. The beauty of a tourist attraction is not only seen from its attractiveness and uniqueness but also its high value [1]. An aspect that is no less important is the problem of the quality of service products sold in tourism. The physical aspects are not only beautiful but also the cleanliness of the environment that must be maintained, the cleanliness of the toilets, comfort and ease of access to reach these attractions. In addition, it is also related to human resources on duty at tourist attractions, especially in terms of appearance,

¹ <https://www.inews.id/travel/destinasi/sektor-utama-ekonomi-nasional-pariwisata-akan-menjadi-penghasil-devisa-terbesar>

communication, ability to guide tourists and also their understanding of excellent service. Good and friendly service allows tourists to be interested in returning and informing others.

Tourists as consumers will compare the quality of the expected service that is expected before visiting a tourist spot with the perceived service received [2]. Three important aspects of service quality which constitute a profit strategy are how to attract more new tourists, retain existing tourists, and how to make efforts to keep tourists coming back. If tourists feel that the service received or felt is as expected, then the quality of service is perceived as good and satisfying. Customers make decisions based on perceptions rather than reality as stated by [3]. Therefore it can be said that a good quality image is not seen from the perception of the company in this case is the manager of tourist attractions, but based on the perception of tourists [4]. According to [5], the main factor determining customer satisfaction is customer perception of service quality.

Customer satisfaction arises after someone has gained experience with the quality of services provided by service providers [6]. Consumers will recommend to friends, family, or colleagues based on the satisfaction they get in using or enjoying an item or service that affects satisfaction or dissatisfaction [7]. In the field of tourism, customer satisfaction is reflected in tourist satisfaction which will be followed by providing recommendations to others (family, friends, or business relations). Service quality is an effort to meet needs and balance them with consumer expectations [8].

If we can provide satisfaction to tourists through the services and services offered, it is certain that tourists will come back and even provide recommendations to others. Therefore, the managers of attractions must pay more attention to the importance of service for visiting tourists, not only thinking about the big profit side but also having to balance it with the intention to provide the best service. Because now it is increasingly realized that customer service and satisfaction are vital aspects in order to survive in business and win the competition [9].

One of the interesting tourist attractions in the capital city of Jakarta is the Taman Mini Indonesia Indah (TMII) on the idea of First Lady Tien Suharto. TMII was built in 1972 on a land area of 150 hectares and was inaugurated on April 20, 1975. This park is a miniature form of Indonesia consisting of 33 provinces (in 1975) which are displayed in the form of traditional houses with different building shapes, complete with its arts and culture in the form of dances and songs with musical instruments typical of each region and colorful regional clothes and various motifs. The provincial pavilion is built around a lake with a miniature of the Indonesian Archipelago, thematically divided into six zones; Java, Sumatra, Kalimantan, Sulawesi, Bali and Nusa Tenggara, Maluku and Papua. Each pavilion features a typical local building.²

At the age of 46 years, in addition to the platforms for each province, many children's playgrounds, swimming pools and other recreational facilities have been built. This certainly illustrates a rapid progress for TMII. But unfortunately, this development is not accompanied by a good quality of service. This can be seen from the environmental conditions, toilets, the officers who look less friendly and do not provide the information needed by tourists. Tourists who visit certainly expect maximum satisfaction. By paying the entrance ticket, they expect compensation in the form of service from friendly officers and satisfaction when visiting.

Based on the problems above, this research is intended to answer the questions: (1) why are there many tourists complained regarding the quality services provided by TMII and (2) how are the strategies to improve the service quality so that tourists feel satisfied. The results

² https://www.tamanmini.com/pesona_indonesia/tentang_tmii.php

of this study will provide a great contribution to the managers of tourist attractions, observers of the tourism sector and all parties who are interested in the world of tourism.

2. Literature Review

Service quality

[8] states that service quality is an effort to fulfill consumer needs and desires as well as the accuracy of delivery in balancing consumer expectations). By comparing consumer perceptions of the services they receive with the services they expect, we can determine the service quality of a company. [10] states that an effort made by an organization with the aim of providing satisfaction to customers, fellow employees as well as leaders is a service.

Meanwhile, [11] state that the ability of employees to provide services supported by problem solving skills and high commitment is a service. Even Lewis and Booms in [12] suggest that service quality is a parameter if we want to know how good the service is, and whether this is in line with customer expectations. Meanwhile, Garvin in [13] says that quality lies in the person who sees it, in this case the consumer.

According to [14] service is any action that one party can offer to another, which is essentially intangible and does not result in any ownership. Service is actually the behavior of producers in order to meet the needs and expectations of consumers. According to [15] service quality includes many dimensions including: (a). The friendliness of employees when serving customers, (b). Ease of access to get services, (c). Employee knowledge, (d). Speed of service to customers, (e). Comfort while waiting for service.

[13] divide service quality into five dimensions as follows: (a). Reliability, namely a reliable company that is able to provide services as promised, (b). Tangible, related to physical facilities, website, worker equipment, and communication delivery, (c). Responsiveness, namely the ability of employees to carry out their duties related to fast service to consumers, (d). Assurance, namely the knowledge possessed by employees that can be seen from their manners or politeness, competence, and can be trusted. (e). Empathy, namely the full attention given by employees to their customers.

Factors that affect service quality are expected service and perceived service as stated by Parasuraman in [16]. If the perceived service exceeds the expected service, then the service quality is perceived as an ideal quality. On the other hand, if the perceived service is worse than the expected service, then the service quality is perceived to be negative or bad. Therefore, whether or not the quality of service is good depends on the ability of the company and its staff to consistently meet customer expectations. There are 5 dimensions of service quality as stated by Parasuraman, Zeithaml, and Berry in [16], namely: (1). Tangible (appearance of physical facilities, equipment, and personnel); (2). Empathy (condition for caring, giving personal attention to customers); (3). Reliability (the ability of officers and companies to keep promises to consumers; 4) Responsiveness (officers who are responsive in helping customers); (5) Assurance (the ability of employees who can foster customer confidence and trust) in tabular form by [17].

Table 1
Dimensions and Attributes of the SERVQUAL model

No	Dimension	Atribute
1.	Reliability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Provide services as promised b) Reliable in handling service problems c) Delivering services correctly from the first time d) Delivering services in accordance with the time promised d) Keep records/documents without errors
2.	Responsiveness	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Informing customers about the certainty of the time of service delivery b) Prompt/fast service for customers c) Willingness to help customers d) Readiness to respond to customer requests
3.	Assurance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Employees who foster a sense of trust among employees b) Make customers feel safe when making transactions c) Employees are consistently polite d) Employees who are knowledgeable and able to answer questions
4.	Empathy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Give individual attention to the customer b) Employees who treat customers fairly attentive c) Really put the interests first customer d) Employees who understand customer needs e) Convenient operating time
5.	Tangibles	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Modern equipment b) Visually appealing facilities c) Employees who look neat and professional d) Materials related to powerful services e) visual attraction

Source : Tjiptono & Chandra (2011 : 232-233)

In improving service quality, we need to consider several factors as stated by [18] namely: (a) Identifying the main determinants of service quality, which include factors such as security, timeliness, and others; (b). Manage customer expectations. Every company is expected to be wiser in giving promises to customers because the greater the promise given, the greater the customer expectations; (c). Manage evidence of service quality. In contrast to products that are tangible, while service is a performance, customers tend to pay attention to "what kind of service will be provided" and "what kind of service has been received"; (d). Educate consumers about services. This effort aims to realize the service process effectively and efficiently.

Meanwhile, [19] argue that to make a destination superior, the measurement of the attractiveness of a tourist destination is seen from: (a). Culture/heritage; (b). Infrastructure; (c). Activities; (d). Convenience; (e). Shopping; (f). Entertainment; (g). Special events/festivals; (h). Supporting factors; (i). Quality of service; (j). Accessibility of destinations; (k). Price.

Tourist Satisfaction

The word satisfaction comes from the Latin "satis" (meaning good enough, adequate) and "facio" (doing or making). Satisfaction can be interpreted as "efforts to fulfill something" or "to make something adequate". [20] define consumer satisfaction as the level of one's feelings after comparing the performance he perceives with his expectations. If performance fails to meet expectations, customers will be dissatisfied. If performance matches expectations, customers will be satisfied. If performance exceeds expectations, the customer will be very satisfied or happy.

Companies use several methods to measure customer satisfaction [16] among others: (a) Provide opportunities for customers to submit complaints and provide suggestions. Information obtained from customers will be very useful input for the company to improve its shortcomings; (b) Ghost Shopping (Mystery Shopping) by employing several ghost shoppers to act or pretend to be potential customers. Then they will report their findings regarding the strengths and weaknesses of the company's products and competitors; (c). Lost Customer Analysis. The company will find out its customers who have stopped buying products or who have changed suppliers, in order to understand the reasons why those customers have moved elsewhere; (d). Customer satisfaction survey. Most customer satisfaction research is conducted using survey methods, either by mail, telephone, e-mail, website, or face-to-face interviews. Through surveys, the company will get feedback and direct feedback from customers and will also give a positive impression on its customers.

3. Research Method

This research is a qualitative research that uses a case study approach. This research focuses intensively on one particular object which is studied as a case. The case study method allows the researcher to remain holistic and significant. The case study is a qualitative research method based on human understanding and behavior based on differences in values, beliefs and scientific theory [21]. Furthermore, [22] suggests that the case study method as a type of descriptive approach, is research that is carried out intensively, detailed and in-depth on an organism (individual), institution or particular symptom with a narrow area or subject [23]. "This research uses a case study approach because this design is a more suitable strategy when answering questions with how or why.

A good case study contains a clear vision of the boundaries for the case and provides an explicit explanation of what it is [24] and [25]. [25] also explains that the case study approach is more often used for qualitative than quantitative research. Meanwhile, Patton divides three types of qualitative data collection methods, namely in-depth interviews, direct observation, and written documents [26]. Interviews and observations are data collection tools that are widely used by various studies and this shows that the two tools are central to all traditions of qualitative research and thus requires additional attention from researchers [27].

In this study, researchers used semi-structured interview techniques because in accordance with what was stated by [28], semi-structured interviews were interview guides carried out in an effort to find problems more openly, where the parties involved were invited to ask each other for opinions or ideas. Interviews were conducted by submitting several questions contained in the interview guide. Researchers can also add some questions beyond the questions contained in the interview guide to deepen the research.

In this study, 10 tourists were interviewed consisting of: 2 foreign tourists from the Netherlands, 2 students, 2 housewives, 2 employees, and 2 teachers. Interview was also conducted with an academic to get information on what tourist object should do to improve the quality of service at TMII with the goal is to increase the customer' satisfaction. Due to ethical

issues, and objections from the informants, in this study, the names of the informants are only written in the form of initials.

Meanwhile, related to data analysis, this study uses the Stake data analysis technique [29] which reveals four forms of data analysis and their interpretation in case study research, namely: (1) category collection where the researcher looks for a collection of data examples and hope to find meaning that is relevant to the issues that will arise; (2) direct interpretation which is a process of pulling data separately and putting it back together to make it more meaningful; (3) researchers form patterns and look for equivalence between two or more categories; (4) in the end, the researcher develops naturalistic generalizations through data analysis, these generalizations are drawn through people who can learn from a case, whether their own case or apply it to a population of cases.

4. Results

The results of interviews with informants are summarized in the table below.

Table 2
Results of interviews with tourists

No	Aspects	Participants' Opinions
Aspects that tourists complain about		
1.	Hygiene Problem	a) Environmental Cleanliness b) Pavilion Cleanliness c) Playground Cleanliness d) Toilet Cleanliness
2.	Poorly maintained and less-organized existing facilities	a) Every pavilion looks unkempt b) Many playgrounds have been damaged c) Facilities with very little visual appeal d) Food stalls are not well organized e) Existing equipment is outdated f) Lack of availability and ease of communication facilities (telephone signal, internet, socket)
3.	Performing Arts Problem	a) Lack of performing arts displayed b) The instructions presented are not packaged attractively c) The show does not involve the wider community such as schools, but only dancers from professional studios
4.	Human Resources Problem	(a) Unfriendly (b) Unresponsive (c) Lack of neat and professional appearance (d) Lack of willingness to help customers (e) Lack of understanding of tourist needs (f) Lack of knowledge about provincial platforms as well as about Indonesia in general
Aspects to be considered to make improvement on customer' satisfaction and service quality		

	Customer' satisfaction	Service Quality
1.	Facilities and Infrastructure	1. Reliability
2.	Activities	2. Responsiveness
3.	Attractive Events	3. Assurance
4.	Convenience of the environment Shopping area	4. Empathy
5.	Accessibility of destinations	5. Tangible
6.	Service Quality	
7.	Cultural/ Heritage	

5. Discussion

From interviews with informants, data was obtained that they very rarely visited TMII due to the current condition of the place being unattractive and looking poorly maintained. This shows the lack of professionalism of the manager in managing this tourist spot, even though TMII is a state asset which is a representation of Indonesia in the form of a miniature. As a service business in the field of tourism, of course the manager must understand how to provide the best service for customers, which in this case are tourists. Service is closely related to service.

“It is unfortunate that TMII, which used to be the pride of the Indonesian nation, is currently in a very poor condition. Existing facilities look outdated. In addition, cleanliness is not paid attention to so that the impression obtained is that this tourist attraction is not well cared for. Nothing new and interesting. In addition, the show schedules have been reduced a lot and the shows shown are also less varied and less attractively packaged so that it feels monotonous. When I took my son to visit the provincial pavilions, he felt bored because he only listened to the guide talking, and there was almost no interaction with tourists. In fact, the message to be conveyed is very important so that the younger generation knows more about their own country. I think there needs to be a lot of improvement so that TMII can rise again.”(UY- housewife)

“What is most concerning in my opinion is the problem of toilets which, apart from being few in number, are difficult to access because the distances between the toilets are quite far and the conditions are not clean, and there are no toilets available for people with disabilities. This is just a matter of toilets, as well as the issue of canteens, or food stalls that are not well organized, making visitors feel uncomfortable being in that place. In terms of cleanliness, it is very lacking, so that we as visitors who want to enjoy this tourist spot feel dissatisfied. As a teacher who regularly brings students to TMII every year to introduce Indonesia, I feel that the service provided by the management to visitors is very lacking and needs to be improved.” (EW- elementary teacher)

The statements of these two informants are in accordance with Kotler's statement which was quoted again by [16]. The experience of these informants shows that (expected service) is not in accordance with perceived service said Parasuraman in [16]. In addition, the problem of human resources is also a major factor in the service. From the results of interviews obtained data that the officers who work at this tourist spot pay less attention to the appearance of the

officers who meet directly with tourists. These officers are also less skilled in serving visitors. Many of them still lacked knowledge regarding the information about the province he described. The officers are also not friendly and there is no welcome to guests when entering the pavilion.

“I look more at the human resources side. It seems that the officers here are not trained in communication even though this is a tourist place that will definitely be visited by many people. They also seem to have never received training related to excellent service. They rarely smile. This is very incompatible with the work in the world of tourism that is run. The officers are also less serious about paying attention to tourists. (RE- Foreign tourists)

This is in line with the statement of [11] and Lewis and Booms in [12] which suggests that service quality can be interpreted as a measure of how well the level of service provided is able to match the expectations or expectations of customers. . This statement is also in accordance with the opinion of [15] that the quality of service itself is very broad which includes many dimensions including: a). The friendliness of employees when serving customers, b). Ease of access to get services, c). Employee knowledge, d. Speed of service to customers, e). Comfort while waiting for service. Meanwhile, when asked whether the participants had ever been given a customer satisfaction survey or had written in the suggestion box provided, the 10 interviewees said they had never.

“I've never seen a suggestion box provided especially on the platforms. Even if there is a box it's worn out and looks like it's never been checked. So it's useless if I write my suggestion there, it will not be followed up. Moreover, surveys about tourist satisfaction. Wow never. It seems that TMII never accepts input from visitors.” (IO - student)

“TMII has never maintained a good relationship with the tourists who have visited. After every visit to the provincial pavilion, we are never asked to fill out email address data where the manager can establish contact with tourists by sending emails to promote events that will be held, including filling out questionnaires to improve quality, different from other tourist attractions that maintain good relations with tourists. Because the program is not interesting and the condition of the tourist motorcycle taxis is not well maintained, I have never held employee recreation events to TMII, even though, unfortunately this place should be a place where our children learn about the various cultures of their country.” (HI-employees)

“To increase the tourist satisfaction, TMII has to make changes in many ways, such as the condition of facilities and infrastructure, more organized activities or programs, convenience, shopping, entertainment, special events such as performing arts/festivals, supporting factors, quality of service; accessibility of destinations, and price. In addition, improving the quality of special services for human resources is determined by the aspects of reliability, responsiveness, assurance, empathy, and tangibles.” (YU- Lecturer)

From the interview above, it is known that efforts to improve services have never been carried out properly. The condition of the suggestion box is shabby and it seems that there has

never been any follow-up, tourists have also never been asked to fill out questionnaires, there is no established relationship created by the manager with tourists.

This is in line with Kotler's statement quoted by [16] that there are 4 methods to measure customer satisfaction, namely by following up customer suggestions, questionnaires, looking for customers who never come again (lost customer analysis). TMII as a national tourist attraction must improve the quality of its services so that it can become a major tourist destination for domestic and foreign tourists. The statement of the informant above is also in accordance with the statement of [13] and Parasuraman, Zeithaml, and Berry in [16] regarding 5 aspects to assess service quality, namely reliability, responsiveness, assurance, empathy, and tangibles, and also suitable with the statement of Dwyer and Kim (2003:400) that the attractiveness of a tourist destination is seen from the Culture/heritage, Infrastructure, Activities, Convenience, Shopping, Entertainment, Special events/festivals, Supporting factors, Quality of service; Accessibility of destinations and price.

6. Conclusion

From the results of the analysis above, it can be concluded that tourist satisfaction has not been the main factor considered by TMII managers. This is related to the physical condition of the tourist site itself which is poorly maintained, so that visitors feel uncomfortable. Another problem is human resources who appear untrained, uncommunicative and unresponsive and do not understand what tourists want. The result of this study shows that to improve the service quality of a tourist destination 5 service quality must be considered namely reliability, responsiveness, assurance, empathy, and tangibles. This research also proved that to increase the customer' satisfaction, elements must be considered are the culture/heritage, facilities and infrastructure, activities or program, convenience, shopping, entertainment, special events such as performing arts/festivals, supporting factors, quality of service; accessibility of destinations and price. For future research, the researcher suggests that a study related to the quality of human resources in the tourism sector should be carried out with a different approach.

References

- [1] Pendit, Nyoman S. (1994). Ilmu Pariwisata: Sebuah Pengantar Perdana. Jakarta: Pradnya Paramita.
- [2] Radiosunu. (2001). Manajemen Pemasaran : Suatu Pendekatan Analisis. Yogyakarta, BPFE.
- [3] Schiffman, Leon G., Kanuk, Leslie L. (2004). Consumer Behavior (eight edition). New Jersey: Prentice Hall.
- [4] Tjiptono, Fandy. (2002). Strategi Pemasaran. Yogyakarta : Penerbit Andi.
- [5] Bitner, Mary Jo, Zeithaml, Valerie A, (1996). Services Marketing. Edisi 1. Boston. MC Graw-Hill.
- [6] Josee Bloemer, Ko de Ruyter, and Martin Wetzels (1998). "Customer Loyalty in a Service Setting", in E - European Advances in Consumer Research Volume 3, eds. Basil G. English and Anna Olofsson, Provo, UT : Association for Consumer Research, Pages: 162-
- [7] Wicaksono, Satrio Arry. (2005). Pengaruh Persepsi Kualitas Layanan Terhadap Kepuasan Klien dan Dampaknya Pada Preferensi Rekomendasi Klien. Jurnal Ekonomi Perusahaan, IBII Vol.12-No.3.
- [8] Tjiptono, Fandy. (2007). Strategi Pemasaran. Edisi ke dua, penerbit Andi, Yogyakarta.
- [9] Tjiptono, Fandy. (2004). Manajemen Jasa, Edisi Pertama, Yogyakarta, Andi Offset.

- [10] Kasmir. (2017). *Customer Service Excellent Teori dan Praktik*. Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada.
- [11] Armistead, C.G., G. Clark. (1996). *Customer Service And Support (Layanan dan Dukungan Kepada Pelanggan)*. PT Elex Media Komputindo – Kelompok Gramedia, Jakarta, hal. 43-47.
- [12] Tjiptono, Fandy and Gregorius Chandra. (2017). *Variable yang mempengaruhi kepuasan konsumen*. Yogyakarta.
- [13] Lovelock, C and Wirtz, J. (2004). “*Services Marketing*”, Fifth Edition, Prentice Hall, New Jersey, p. 407.
- [14] Philip Kotler, (2002), *Manajemen Pemasaran, Edisi Millenium, Jilid 2*, PT Prenhallindo, Jakarta. p.83.
- [15] Heineke, Davis, (2003). *Managing Services*, Mc Grow Hill, UK, p.295.
- [16] Fandy, Tjiptono. (2011). *Service Management Mewujudkan Layanan Prima*. Edisi. 2. Yogyakarta: Andi, p. 157.
- [17] Tjiptono, F., & Chandra, G. (2011). *Service, Quality & Satisfaction (edisi ketiga)* Yogyakarta: Penerbit Andi, p. 232-233.
- [18] Tjiptono, Fandy. (2012). *Strategi Pemasaran*, ed. 3, Yogyakarta, Andi. p.182-189.
- [19] Dwyer and Kim. (2003). *Destination competitiveness: determinants and indicators*. *Current issues in tourism*, 6, 369-414.
- [20] Kotler, P., & Keller, K. (2009). *Manajemen Pemasaran (edisi pertama)* Jakarta: Penerbit Erlangga, p. 138.
- [21] Polit, D. F., Beck, C. T., & Hungler. (2004). *Canadian Essential of Nursing Research*. Philadelphia: Lippincot.
- [22] Arikunto, Suharsimi. (1986). *Prosedur Penelitian Suatu Pendekatan Praktek*. Jakarta: Bina Aksara.
- [23] Yin, Robert K. (2008). *Case Study Research: Design and Methods (Applied. Social Research Methods)*. Illinois : Sage Publications, Inc.
- [24] Burns, Robert B. (2000). *Introduction to Research Methods*. London: SAGE Publications.
- [25] Denscombe, M (2007). *The good research guide: For small-scale social research projects*. Maidenhead: Open University Press.
- [26] Alsa, A. (2014). *Pendekatan Kuantitatif dan Kualitatif serta Kombinasinya dalam Penelitian Psikologi*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Belajar.
- [27] Creswell, J. W. (2007) *Qualitative inquiry & research design: Choosing among five approaches*. 2nd edn. California: Sage.
- [28] Sugiyono. (2010). *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan*. Bandung : CY Alfabeta.
- [29] Stake, Robert E. (2006). *Multiple case study analysis*. NY: The Guilford Press.

Websites:

- [1] <https://www.inews.id/travel/destinasi/sektor-utama-ekonomi-nasional-pariwisata-akan-menjadi-penghasil-devisa-terbesar>
- [2] https://www.tamanmini.com/pesona_indonesia/tentang_tmii.php